

MCIB

Marine Casualty Investigation Board



Leeson Lane, Dublin 2.

Telephone: 01-6782460.

Fax: 01-6783129.

email: info@mcib.ie

www.mcib.ie

**REPORT INTO THE LOSS
OVERBOARD OF A
CREWMEMBER
FROM THE
MFV "GIRL GERALDINE"
ON 4th AUGUST 2007**

The Marine Casualty Investigation Board was established on the 25th March, 2003 under The Merchant Shipping (Investigation of Marine Casualties) Act 2000

The copyright in the enclosed report remains with the Marine Casualty Investigation Board by virtue of section 35(5) of the Merchant Shipping (Investigation of Marine Casualties) Act, 2000. No person may produce, reproduce or transmit in any form or by any means this report or any part thereof without the express permission of the Marine Casualty Investigation Board. This report may be freely used for educational purposes.

REPORT No. MCIB/146



Report MCIB/146 published by The Marine Casualty Investigation Board
23rd January 2009

	PAGE
1. SYNOPSIS	4
2. FACTUAL INFORMATION	5
3. EVENTS PRIOR TO THE INCIDENT	6
4. THE INCIDENT	7
5. EVENTS FOLLOWING THE INCIDENT	8
6. CONCLUSIONS	9
7. RECOMMENDATIONS	10
8. LIST OF APPENDICES	11
9. LIST OF CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED	23

1. SYNOPSIS

- 1.1 The 19.81 metre fishing vessel MFV “Girl Geraldine” left Dunmore East Fishery Harbour Centre on the morning of the 4th August 2007 for the fishing grounds south of Dunabrattin Head Co. Waterford.
- 1.2 There were four crewmembers on board.
- 1.3 Whilst shooting nets from the starboard outboard pound, a crewmember Mr. Jurgis Stanys was caught in the bight of the net rope tail and was carried overboard and drowned.
- 1.4 Mr. Jurgis Stanys was recovered from the sea after a short interval. Attempts were made at CPR but his body showed no sign of life.
- 1.5 Mr. Jurgis Stanys was pronounced dead on arrival of the MFV “Girl Geraldine” at Dunmore East Fishery Harbour Centre on the morning of the 5th August 2007.

2. FACTUAL INFORMATION

2.1 Vessel description

Type	Trawler
Name	MFV "Girl Geraldine"
Official Number	401617
Length	60.3 Feet
Breadth	22.5 Feet
Built	1977
Material	Wood
Engine Power	310 KW
Gross Tonnage	79.02
Net Tonnage	36.07
Registered	D153 Dublin

2.2 Vessel Type

Gill net trawler.

2.3 Safety Equipment

The vessel carried safety equipment in compliance with regulations. The vessel carried lifejackets and Personal Flotation Device (PFD) for every person on board. Two Six men life rafts were carried.

2.4 Manning

The vessel had four persons on board at the time of the incident.

Skipper: Mr. Richard Power.
COC Second Hand Special Number 685. Issued 20/06/1983
Experience, 29 Years fishing.

Crewmember No. 1: Mr. Darin Walsh
Qualification: BIM Basic Training

Crewmember No. 2: Mr. Brian Murphy
Qualification: BIM Basic Training - (Unavailable for interview).

Crewmember No. 3: Mr. Jurgis Stanys
Experience: 4 years on the MFV "Girl Geraldine". 20 years previous experience in the fishing industry.

The MFV "Girl Geraldine" was manned in accordance with the Fishing Vessels Officers Regulations 1988.

3. EVENTS PRIOR TO THE INCIDENT

- 3.1 The MFV “Girl Geraldine” left Dunmore East Harbour between 11.00 and 11.30 hrs on the morning of the 4th August 2007. The vessel was headed for the fishing grounds south of Dunabrattin Head Co. Waterford.
- 3.2 The vessel averaged 8 knots and finally arrived at the chosen fishing grounds at about 21.00 hrs.
- 3.3 Crew were rested on passage.
- 3.4 The first net was then shot at about 21.30 hrs in about 70 metres of water and at this stage all hands were engaged in the working of the vessel.
- 3.5 The vessel then continued to shoot nets till the time of the incident at about 23.00 hrs.
- 3.6 The method of fishing was to set several independent nets of approximately 1.8 miles long, anchored to the sea bed with 30 fathoms (55 metres) of line to a 30kg anchor, and marked with 90 fathoms (165 metres) of rope to a buoy.
- 3.7 The weather throughout this period was South West Force 3 to 5 (See Appendix 8.2 - weather report).
- 3.8 Mr. Jurgis Stanys was in position on the main unexposed deck and his job was to monitor the run of the net from the starboard aft net pound.
- 3.9 Mr. Jurgis Stanys was not wearing a PFD (Personal Floatation Device) at the time of the accident. The absence of a PFD was not a contributory factor to his death.
- 3.10 Mr. Jurgis Stanys was dressed in an oilskin bottom and orange hoodie.

4. THE INCIDENT

- 4.1 The last net in the starboard aft pound was nearing its end at approximately 23.00 hrs. Just prior to the incident Mr. Jurgis Stanys was seen standing on the main deck forward of the net pounds and clear of all lines.
- 4.2 A shout was heard from this area and Mr. Jurgis Stanys was seen being dragged over the stern rail atop of the starboard net pound. There was no witness to the events just prior to the sighting of Mr. Jurgis Stanys being seen as mentioned in point 4.1. The position of the vessel was 51 34.0 North and 007 18.0 West. Depth of water was 40 fathoms.
- 4.3 The engines were put astern and the vessel brought about. Mr. Jurgis Stanys was recovered from the water in approximately 7 to 8 minutes with the bight of the net rope tail knotted around his left leg. His cause of death was drowning.

5. EVENTS FOLLOWING THE INCIDENT

- 5.1 Once aboard the fishing vessel, attempts were made to resuscitate Mr. Jurgis Stanys using CPR. These attempts were unsuccessful. The Skipper of the vessel alerted the Irish Coast Guard by radio at 23.07 hrs ships time. They in turn informed the Gardai.
- 5.2 ETA Dunmore East 05.00 hrs LMT. Dunmore East Coast Guard Unit tasked to assist on arrival. On arrival at Dunmore East Fishery Harbour Centre, the vessel was met by the Gardai and the local Coast Guard unit. The body of Mr. Jurgis Stanys was removed from the vessel.

6. CONCLUSIONS

- 6.1 The body of Mr. Jurgis Stanys was recovered from the water with a rope knotted (half hitch) around his left leg.
- 6.2 There was no witness to the series of events, which led to this incident. However, it must have been instantaneous and with catastrophic results.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 7.1 The introduction of a Safety Management System should be considered so that the safety of crew is considerably improved.
- 7.2 A copy of the Code of Safe Working Practices for Merchant Seamen should be carried on all Fishing Vessels.

8. LIST OF APPENDICES

	PAGE
8.1 Transcript of Register for the vessel MFV “Girl Geraldine”.	12
8.2 Weather Report for the period.	14
8.3 Sitreps from the MRCC Dublin.	16
8.4 Photographs of the accident site and the fishing vessel MFV “Girl Geraldine”.	
8.4(1) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Forward Part.	17
8.4(2) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Starboard aft net pound.	17
8.4(3) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Starboard net pound.	18
8.4(4) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Area of protected deck area where Mr. Jurgis Stanys was standing prior to the accident.	18
8.4(5) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Anchor for nets.	19
8.4(6) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Anchor arrangements for nets.	19
8.4(7) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - From Astern.	20
8.5 S.I. No 586/2001 Fishing Vessel (Personal Floatation Devices) Regulations, 2001.	21

APPENDIX 8.1

Appendix 8.1 Transcript of Register for the vessel MFV "Girl Geraldine".

REGISTRY
FORM No. 19.

Signal Letters (if any).....
COMMUNICATIONS

Transcript of Register for Transmission to the Department of the Marine and Natural Resources Dublin

Official Number		Name of Ship		No., Date and Port of Registry			
401617		GIRL GERALDINE		7 IN 1977, DUBLIN			
No., Date and Port of previous Registry (if any)							
How Propelled		Where Built	When Built	Name and Address of Builders			
MOTOR SINGLE SCREW		MALAHIDE	1977	MALAHIDE SHIPYARD, MALAHIDE CO-DUBLIN			
Number of Decks	Length from fore part of stem to the aft side of the head of the stern post/fore side of the rudder stock ...		Feet	Tenths		
Number of Masts	Main breadth to outside of plating ...		AS BEFORE			
Rigged	Depth in hold from tonnage deck to ceiling amidships ...					
Stem	Depth in hold from upper deck to ceiling amidships, in the case of two decks and upwards ...					
Stern	Depth from top of upper deck at side amidships to bottom of keel ...					
Build	Round of Beam on upper deck ...					
Framework and description of vessel	...	Length of engine room, if any ...					
Number of Bulkheads						
PARTICULARS OF PROPELLING ENGINES, &c. (if any), as supplied by Builders, Owners or Engine Makers.							
No. of sets of Engines	Description of Engines	When made	Name and address of makers	Reciprocating Engines		Rotary Engines	Estimated Brake or Shaft Power (KW)
				No. of Cylinders in each set	Diameter of Cylinders	No. of Cylinders in each set	
ONE	I.C., C.I., RECIPROCATING	Engines 1992	Engines CATERPILLAR TRACTOR COMPANY ILLINOIS U.S.A.	TWELVE	137 MM		310
No. of Shafts	Particulars of Boilers		Boilers	Length of Stroke			Estimated Speed of Ship
	Description.....	Boilers		Length of Stroke			
ONE				152 MM			10 KNOTS
Number of water ballast tanks, and their capacity in tons:—							
PARTICULARS OF TONNAGE							
The tonnages of this ship, in accordance with her Tonnage Certificate are:—							
GROSS TONNAGE:— AS BEFORE tons (AS BEFORE cubic metres)							
REGISTER TONNAGE:— AS BEFORE tons (AS BEFORE cubic metres)							
This ship is assigned with a tonnage mark on each side of the ship which is.....inches below the upper deck line and when this mark is submerged the above tonnages are applicable. When the tonnage mark is NOT submerged the following tonnages are applicable:—							
GROSS TONNAGE:— tons (.....cubic metres)							
REGISTER TONNAGE:— tons (.....cubic metres)							
A detailed summary of the tonnages for the ship is shown on The Tonnage Certificate.							
* Delete if not applicable.							
The number of seamen and apprentices for whom accommodation is certified.. AS..BEFORE.							

C. & E. No. 675

N.B.—To be sent in an envelope addressed to An Párlamh-Oifig Chláraithe agus Taiscanta Iomána agus Máirnéalach, 26/27, Cé na Eadain, Baile Átha Cliath, 1.

Sec. C. & E. 661/454/64.
(SEE OVER)

Appendix 8.1 Transcript of Register for the vessel MFV "Girl Geraldine"..

Name of Master	Certificate of Competency No.
Names, Residence, and Description of the Owners, and Number of Sixty-fourth Shares held by Each ... viz..	
28 TH AUGUST 2002. ALTERATION OF ENGINE PARTICULARS SHOWN IN RED INK. CERTIFICATE OF SURVEY DATED AT DUBLIN ON 18 TH FEBRUARY 2002.	
<div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 2px; display: inline-block;"> Registrar of Shipping Customs & Excise 26 AUG 2002 </div>	
Dated 28 TH AUGUST 2002	Stamping Building Dublin Castle Dublin 2 A/Registrar.
NOTE:—Registrars are requested to distinguish the Managing Owner by placing the letters "M.O." against his name.	
References of Transactions	Change of Masters

S.O. 266/77. 12/1008 G7. 2nd. 11/77. MARINE CASUALTY INVESTIGATION BOARD

Appendix 8.2 Weather Report for the period.



MET ÉIREANN
The Irish Meteorological Service

Glasnevin Hill,
Dublin 9, Ireland.

Cnoc Ghlas Naíon
Baile Átha Cliath 9, Éire.
www.met.ie

Tel: +353-1-806 4200
Fax: +353-1-806 4247
E-mail: met.eireann@met.ie

**Weather Report for sea area 38 miles south of Dunbrattin Head
on 04 – Aug - 2007 between 12:00 hours and 24:00 hours Local Time.**

General Meteorological Situation: A cold front traversed the area at 6:00 am on the Saturday morning before becoming slow moving near Carnsore Point during the forenoon. This front trailed back into a newly forming wave depression. The depression of 1014 hPa 500 miles southwest of the location deepened to 1007 hPa during the day and was located 20 miles southwest of the area by 24:00 hours on 4-Aug-07. This active system brought widespread rain, low cloud and poor visibility to the area late in the day. This rain would have been heavy with amounts of more than 10 mm possible in 4 hours.

From 12:00 to 15:00 hours (Local Time):

Winds: Southwest force 4 to 5

Weather: Intermittent drizzle or light rain.

Visibility: Mostly moderate, with cloud base of 400 meters

Sea state: Moderate to rough

From 15:00 to 18:00 hours (Local Time):

Winds: Southwest force 4 to 5, occasional gusts to force 6

Weather: Occasional drizzle and rain

Visibility: Moderate decreasing poor. Cloud base came down to 200 meters

Sea state: Moderate

From 18:00 to 21:00 hours (Local Time):

Winds: South to southwest force 4 to 5

Weather: Heavier and more continuous rain. Mist and drizzle

Visibility: Mostly poor. Cloud base 100 meters

Sea state: Moderate, but choppy

From 21:00 to 24:00 hours (Local Time):

Winds: Variable mainly southwest force 3 to 5

Weather: Heavy rain

Visibility: Poor with some fog visibilities of less than 1000 meters

Sea state: Moderate

Appendix 8.2 Weather Report for the period.



MET ÉIREANN
The Irish Meteorological Service

Glasnevin Hill,
Dublin 9, Ireland.

Cnoc Ghlas Naíon
Baile Átha Cliath 9, Éire.
www.met.ie

Tel: +353-1-806 4200
Fax: +353-1-806 4247
E-mail: met.eireann@met.ie

Note 1. The above conditions were derived mainly from Buoy M5 data (see below), but also from consulting the nearby Met Eireann Synoptic stations namely Roches Point to the southwest, and Rosslare approx 90 Km to the east-northeast. Archived Satellite and Radar data were also used, together with analysed surface charts during the period in question.

Note 2. Buoy M5 is positioned approximately 18 miles east of the incident area.

Nearby observations from offshore weather buoy M5 (station number 62094) position 51.41 N 6 42 W

Station number	Date Time GMT	Wind Direction	Wind Speed (knots)	Wave Height (meters)
Buoy M5	12:00	Southwest	18	2.2 meters
	15:00	Southwest	17	1.9 meters
	21:00	Southwest	17	2.2meters
	24:00	Southwest	17	2.2 meters

UTC Universal Time Coordinate = Greenwich Meantime
 XXXX Local Time = British Summer Time = UTC + 1 hour
 Wind speed and gusts in knots
 Temperatures in degrees Celsius
 Significant wave height in meters

APPENDIX 8.3

Appendix 8.3 Sitreps from the MRCC Dublin.

TRANSMISSION PRIORITY Urgent Ref No. 0019180 File Date 04/08/2007
E.O.S. 200708042330 UIIN Reference 0001168
INCIDENT NAME F/V GIRL GERALDINE
FROM MRCC DUBLIN
TO MRSC MALIN HEAD
MRSC VALENTIA
VS & T
MSO
SAR OPS MANAGER

SITREP NUMBER ONE

A. Identity Of Casualty F/V GIRL GERALDINE/EI2695
B. Position 38 MILES SOUTH OF DUNABRATTIN HEAD CO. WATERFORD
C. Situation DECEASED CREWMAN
D. Number of Persons at risk 1
E. Assistance Required INFORM GARDAI
F. Co-Ordinating RCC DUBLIN
G. Description Of Casualty 37 YR OLD LITHUANIAN CREWMAN
H. Weather SW 3 TO 5
I. Initial Action Taken
J. Search Area
K. Co-Ordinating Instructions
L. Future Plans

Additional Information /
Conclusion

2207 UTC SKIPPER OF F/V GIRL GERALDINE REPORTED THAT HE WAS PROCEEDING TO DUNMORE EAST WITH THE BODY OF A CREWMAN ON BOARD. (THE CASUALTY HAD FALLEN OVERBOARD AND WAS RECOVERED). ETA AT DUNMORE EAST 050400 LT.

2220 UTC WATERFORD GARDAI ADVISED.

2306 UTC TASKED DUNMORE EAST CGU TO ASSIST ON ARRIVAL.

Appendix 8.4 8.4(1) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Forward Part.



Appendix 8.4 8.4(2) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Starboard aft net pound



APPENDIX 8.4

Appendix 8.4 8.4(3) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Starboard net pound.



Appendix 8.4 8.4(4) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - Area of protected deck area where Mr. Jurgis Stanys was standing prior to the accident



Appendix 8.4 8.4(5) MFV "Girl Geraldine" - Anchor for nets.



Appendix 8.4 8.4(6) MFV "Girl Geraldine" - Anchor arrangements for nets.



Appendix 8.4 8.4(7) MFV “Girl Geraldine” - From Astern.



Appendix 8.5 S.I. No 586/2001 Fishing Vessel (Personal Floatation Devices) Regulations, 2001.

S.I. No. 586/2001 — Fishing Vessel (Personal Floatation Devices) Regulations, 2001

S.I. No. 586 of 2001

Fishing Vessel (Personal Floatation Devices) Regulations, 2001

I, FRANK FAHEY, Minister for the Marine and Natural Resources, in exercise of the powers conferred on me by section 19 of the Merchant Shipping Act, 1992, as amended by section 44 of the Merchant Shipping (Investigation of Marine Casualties) Act, and the Marine (Alteration of Name of Department and Name of Minister) Order 1997 (S.I. No. 301 of 1997), hereby make the following Regulations:

Citation and Commencement

1. (1) These Regulations may be cited as the Fishing Vessel (Personal Floatation Devices) Regulations, 2001.
- (2) These Regulations come into operation on 1 March 2002.

Interpretation

2. In these Regulations, unless the context otherwise requires:
 - “crew member” means the skipper or any other person gainfully employed or engaged by the owner or skipper in any capacity on board a fishing vessel;
 - “fishing vessel” means any vessel designed, equipped or used commercially for catching or taking fish or other living resources of the sea (including the sea bed) but does not include a boat that is registered under the law of any State, other than the State;
 - “suitable personal flotation device” means a flotation device-
 - (a) sufficient to give a person using it a positive buoyancy in waters which are likely to be encountered where the vessel on which it is required to be used is reasonably likely to be,
 - (b) which is appropriate to the body weight of the person who is to wear it and also to the type of work being done, and
 - (c) which has on it the CE conformity marking consisting of the initials “CE” taking the form of the specimen given in Annex IV of Council Directive 89/686/EEC of 21 December 1989¹ (as amended by Council Directive 93/63/EEC of 22 July 1993² and Council Directive 96/58/EC of the European Parliament and the Council of 3 September 1996³).

Appendix 8.5 S.I. No 586/2001 Fishing Vessel (Personal Floatation Devices) Regulations, 2001.

Application

3. These Regulations apply to all crew members of fishing vessels.

Selection, Carriage and Wearing of Personal Flotation Devices

4. Every fishing vessel shall carry a suitable personal flotation device for every person on board. The personal flotation device shall be worn at all times by the crew of the fishing vessel, when on the exposed deck of the vessel, or, in the case of open undecked vessels, on board the vessel, whether at sea, in harbour or coming to and from moorings.
5. The skipper of a fishing vessel shall take all reasonable steps to ensure that all crew members wear a personal flotation device when on deck of the vessel, or, in the case of open undecked vessels, on board the vessel, whether at sea, in harbour or coming to and from moorings.

L.S.

GIVEN under my Official Seal

this 14th day of December 2001

Frank Fahey

Minister for the Marine and Natural Resources

EXPLANATORY NOTE

(THIS NOTE IS NOT PART OF THE INSTRUMENT AND DOES NOT PURPORT TO BE A LEGAL INTERPRETATION)

These Regulations require all crew members of a fishing vessel to wear a personal flotation device at all times when on the deck of any fishing vessel or boat irrespective of its size, whether at sea, in harbour or coming to and from moorings.

¹ O.J. No. L.399, 30.12.89, p.18

² O.J. No. L.220, 30.8.93, p.1

³ O.J. No. L.236, 18.9.96, p.44

9. LIST OF CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED

	PAGE
Mr. Richard Power	24
MCIB Response	25
An Garda Siochana	26
MCIB Response	26

CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED



Brownstown,

Dunmore East,

Co Waterford.

2-Oct-2008.

Dear Sir,

I am currently the skipper of the "M.F.V. Giel Geraldine" and was also the skipper of that vessel on 4 August 2007, the date of the incident the subject of the Board's investigation. I refer to the Board's draft report into the loss overboard of crew member Jurgis Stanyis, and in particular, to paragraph 7.1 thereof. I wish to stress that at all times, I have promoted, encouraged and practiced a culture of safety on board

l. auto

the "M.F.V. Girl Geraldine." The clear implication of paragraph 7.1 as drafted is otherwise, which I utterly refute.

Yours sincerely,

Richard Power

Skipper M.F.V. Girl Geraldine"

MCIB RESPONSE

The MCIB wishes to point out that 7.1 of the recommendations was not aimed at any particular boat or Skipper. It was a general recommendation aimed at the fishing fleet in general.

An Garda Síochána

Oifige an Choimisinéara
An Garda Síochána
Páirc an Fhionnuisce
Baile Átha Cliath 8
Éire

Tel/Teileafón: (01) 666 2015 / 2026
Fax/Facs: (01) 666 2013

Luaigh an uimhir tharaghta seo a leanas le do thoil.
Please quote the following ref. number:



Office of the Commissioner
Garda Headquarters
Phoenix Park
Dublin 8
Ireland

Láithreán Gréasáin / Web site:
www.garda.ie

Ríomhphost / E-mail:
commissioner@garda.ie

P.A. 2.1.19
Your Ref: MCIB/146

Mr John G O'Donnell BL
Chairman
Marine Casualty Investigation Board
Lesson lane
Dublin 2

Re: Draft Report of the Investigation into the loss overboard of a crewmember from the F/V Girl Geraldine on 4 August, 2007.

Dear Mr O'Donnell

I am directed by the Commissioner to refer to the above and provide the following in response to your correspondence of the 24 September, 2008.

The two recommendations outlined at page 9 of the draft report are supported.

1. A safety management system should be introduced to improve safety on fishing vessels. All crew members should receive training in safety management, with responsibility for compliance resting with the skippers of such vessels.
2. A copy of the Code of Safety Working Practices for Merchant Seamen should be carried on all fishing vessels, and be available in multi-lingual formats. A written record of training and compliance with the Code of Practice should be maintained and subject to audit.
3. The crews of all fishing vessels should have a basic knowledge of first aid which was relevant to this case.

Yours sincerely


B CORCORAN
CHIEF SUPERINTENDENT
PERSONAL ASSISTANT
TO COMMISSIONER

4 November 2008



Ráiteas Misin / Mission Statement:

An leibhéal inscríobhte is airde a bhaint amach maidir le Cosaint Phearsanta, Tiomantas den Phobal agus Slándáil Stáit.
To achieve the highest attainable level of Personal Protection, Community Commitment and State Security.

MCIB RESPONSE

The MCIB notes the contents of this letter.

