

**REPORT OF THE
INVESTIGATION INTO THE
COLLISION INVOLVING THE
F.V. “*CLARA*” AND THE CARGO
VESSEL “*CORAL ANTILLARUM*”
OFF THE COAST OF CO.
WICKLOW ON 24TH AUGUST
2000.**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		<u>Page No.</u>
1.	SYNOPSIS	3
2.	FACTUAL INFORMATON	4
3.	EVENTS PRIOR TO THE INCIDENT	6
4.	THE INCIDENT	7
5.	EVENTS FOLLOWING THE INCIDENT	8
6.	CONCLUSIONS AND FINDINGS	10
7.	RECOMMENDATIONS	12
8.	APPENDICES	13
9.	INDEX OF CORRESPONDENCE	38

1. SYNOPSIS

At approximately 07.20 hours Summer Time (ST) 24th August 2000 in approximate position 4.6 miles North North East of Wicklow Head and GPS Position Latitude 53 degrees 02.525 minutes North Longitude 005 degrees 59.4 minutes West (See Appendices 8.1, 8.2) a collision occurred in restricted visibility between a fishing vessel the “*Clara*” fishing number D-670 (See Appendix 8.3) which at the time was engaged in fishing and a Netherlands tanker the “*Coral Antillarum*” (See Appendix 8.4).

There were no apparent injuries sustained by personnel involved in the collision and the damage sustained to the fishing vessel appeared to be superficial. No pollution occurred.

The weather conditions at the time were light variable winds with fog patches (See Appendix 8.5).

2. FACTUAL INFORMATION

2.1 Particulars of the “Clara”

Official Number:	403381
Fishing Number	D-670
Port of Registry	Dublin
Built	1997 at Greystones, Co. Wicklow, Ireland
Engines	Made in Moyeurs, Baudovin, Marseille, France. 89 kW
Estimated Speed	8.5 knots
Gross Tonnage	18
Length	11.62 meters

Owner: - Charles Featherstone
Co. Wicklow
Ireland.

2.2 Description of fishing vessel the “Clara”

The “Clara” normally departs from Wicklow harbour each morning between 05.30 and 06.00 hours to fish for whelks off the West Codling and North India Bank. The “Clara” returned to Wicklow again at 15.30 to 16.00 hours the same day. Weather permitting, fishing for whelks is carried out seven days a week. Whelks are collected in pots, which are made up in trains of 50 pots per train. There is a set of about 12 trains lying on the seabed in the area being fished at the time of the collision. Each train is picked up and pots emptied and re-baited as they pass across the side ramp of the “Clara”. While this work is in progress the “Clara” will be stopped in the water. During the fishing operation the Skipper works in the wheelhouse, one deckhand hauls the pots on board, the second will pull the pots down the side ramp and empty them and the third deckhand will re-bait.

2.3 Particulars of the “Coral Antillarum”

Type of ship	Liquefied Gas Tanker (Ammonia)
IMO Number	8016906
Call Sign	PDMJ
Year of Build	1982
Flag	Netherlands
Gross Tonnage	2,400
Speed	11 knots
Engines	Alpha 1,920kW (2,610bhp)

Propellers Controllable Pitch
Length 76.99 meters

Owners: Anthony Veder & Co. B.V.
Rotterdam
Holland

2.4 Description of the “*Coral Antillarum*”.

The vessel trades regularly carrying ammonia gas from Cork to Belfast and returns in ballast.

2.5 Crew on board the “*Clara*”

Mr. Darren Kinsella,	Skipper
Mr. Michael Loughlin	Deckhand
Mr. Danny Ferguson	Deckhand
Mr. Lal Kelly	Deckhand

2.1 Crew on board the “*Coral Antillarum*”

Mr. Simon Versluijs,	Master
Mr. Casper Aalders,	Chief Officer
Mr. Huske Gustian,	Second Officer
Mr. Ivo Verstrepen,	Chief Engineer
Mr. Benjamin Isaak,	Assistant Engineer
Mr. Sugeng Prayitno,	Assistant Engineer
Mr. Saimu,	
Mr. Jose da Silva Carapuco,	Sailor
Mr. Mat Nur Bin Simin,	O/S
Mr. Arnold Paliama,	O/S
Mr. Mohammed Busiri	Cook

3. EVENTS PRIOR TO THE INCIDENT

3.1 Events on board the “Clara”.

- 3.1.1 At approximately 05.50 hours 24th August 2000 the “Clara” sailed from Wicklow harbour with a Skipper and three deckhands.
- 3.1.2 The vessel was working in a position a little north and east of the GPS position Latitude 53 degrees 02.53 minutes North Longitude 005 degrees 59.4 minutes West and had hauled in the first half train of pots.
- 3.1.3 The tides were not strong and the weather condition at the time was very foggy, about 200 to 300 feet (less than 90 meters) visibility. The “Clara” was stopped in the water but heading in a northerly direction.

3.2 Events on board the “Coral Antillarum”

- 3.2.1 20.35 hours ST 23rd August the “Coral Antillarum” departed Belfast for Cork in ballast (no cargo on board).
- 3.2.2 21.06 hours commencing listening watch on vhf channel 16 and 83. The average speed is stated as 11 knots. The engines were set at 800 r.p.m with the Controlled Pitch Propeller (CPP) set at full pitch. This speed will vary with the tides. The engine revolutions or pitch was not adjusted while on sea passage.
- 3.2.3 23.50 hours South Rock 265 degrees true x 1.2 miles the ship shaped a course via the inner route on passage plan dated 02/17/1994. (See Appendices 8.6 and 8.7).
- 3.2.4 02.00 hours 24th August GPS position Latitude 54 degrees 00.7 minutes North, Longitude 005 degrees 34.3 minutes West; (See Appendix 8.8)
- 3.2.5 04.00 hours Rockabill bearing 246 degrees true x 8.7 miles
Poor visibility due to fog was entered in the deck logbook for 00.00 to 04.00 hours watch. (See Appendix 8.8)
- 3.2.6 05.50 hours Kish Bank bearing 150 degrees true x 3.5 miles, course 178 degrees (See Appendix 8.8)
- 3.2.7 07.35 hours Wicklow Head bearing 250 degrees x 1.6 miles, course 190 degrees. (See Appendix 8.8)

4. **THE INCIDENT**

- 4.1 At approximately 07.20 hours the Skipper of the “Clara” who was forward of the wheelhouse saw the bow of a large ship approaching at speed and on collision course. He shouted to his crew to cut the rope to the train of pots and at the same time he ran into the wheelhouse and manoeuvred the “Clara” by applying hard to port the wheel (helm) and full ahead on the engines.
- 4.2 The crew had moved to the aft part of the “Clara” for protection as the ship struck the starboard quarter of the “Clara” with its starboard bow.
- 4.3 On impact the “Clara” listed heavily to port and then returned to the upright. The ship disappeared into the fog.
- 4.4 At the time of the collision the “Clara” was displaying a white masthead light, stern light, port and starboard lights. It did not have fishing lights or day signal displayed. The “Clara” was not making any fog sound signal.

5. EVENTS FOLLOWING THE INCIDENT.

- 5.1 The Skipper of the “Clara” confirmed the hull of the ship that collided with the “Clara” as being orange in colour and a red anti fouling along the water line but he did not see the ship’s name. He called Wicklow Radio Coast Guard’s station and reported the incident and their GPS position as he read it from the GPS receiver unit in the wheelhouse.
- 5.1 The crew of the “Clara” checked the integrity of the hull and headed back to Wicklow harbour (See Appendix 8.9). As a precautionary step they transferred diesel out of the starboard side tank to port side tank.
- 5.2 Visibility poor to moderate was entered in the deck logbook for the 04.00 to 08.00 hours watch on the “Coral Antillarum”
- 5.3 The “Coral Antillarum” anchored off Arklow breakwater bearing 278 degrees true x 2.7 miles for main engine requirements between 08.45 to 09.35 hours
- 5.4 The Marine Survey Office was informed by the Irish Coast Guard at 08.28 hours 24th and an Investigator was appointed to investigate.
- 5.5 Contact was made with ports in the Irish Sea and particularly ports on the east coast of Ireland north of Dun Laoghaire were contacted. A reddish/orange-hulled vessel was reported as having departed Belfast at 20.27 hours 23rd August bound for Cork. The vessel was said to be a Netherlands flagged ammonia gas tanker the “Coral Antillarum” of 2,400 gross tonnage with a length of 77 meters.
- 5.6 The Skipper of the “Clara” was interviewed at the home port of Wicklow and his vessel inspected between 15.05 hours and 16.20 hours on 24th August, the afternoon of the collision. Some paint scrapings that had been deposited onto the side ramp of the fishing vessel from the hull of the unidentified colliding vessel were taken and placed in an envelope and retained by the Investigator (See Appendix 8.10).
- 5.7 The “Coral Antillarum” arrived alongside IFI Marino Point, Cork. at 21.15 hours.
- 5.8 Boarding the “Coral Antillarum” at Marino Point, Cork.**
- 5.8.1 At 21.15 hours 24th August 2000 on the evening of the collision, after berthing alongside at IFI Marino Point, the “Coral Antillarum” was boarded. The reason for the investigation was explained to the Master, Chief Mate and Chief Engineer. The deck logbook and navigational charts were inspected. From that it was established that the “Coral Antillarum” was the ship in the vicinity of the collision at the relevant time earlier that day.

- 5.8.2 The scrapings taken from the fishing vessel earlier that day were shown to the Master who agreed that they appeared to be similar to that from the hull of his ship. The Master stated that this was the first he was aware of the alleged incident. It was agreed that in the morning and under daylight conditions we would launch a lifeboat and inspect the hull of the “*Coral Antillarum*” and particularly in the vicinity of the starboard bow.
- 5.8.3 On the morning of 25th the Gardai from Cobh attended with the P&I (third party insurance) representative for the “*Coral Antillarum*”. A group including the Master, Chief Officer, two Gardai from Cobh Garda Station, P&I surveyor and the Investigator were taken down in the starboard lifeboat to inspect the hull in the forward area from 08.45 to 09.15 hours.
- 5.8.4 Scuffmarks and paint markings that match the navy blue paint from the fishing vessel the “*Clara*” was noted. There were also scrapings, indentations to the steel with some missing layers of paint chippings consistent with recent contact damage. (See Appendices 8.11 and 8.12)
- 5.8.5 The Master’s comments when observing the marks on the morning of 25th August was to the effect that in his opinion it was not crystal clear that the marks were from anything that happened yesterday (24th August) and he could not understand why there were no marks further back along the hull of the “*Coral Antillarum*”.

6. CONCLUSIONS AND FINDINGS

- 6.1 This collision occurred in poor visibility at approximately 07.20 hours 24th August 2000 between a fishing vessel the “Clara” fishing number D-670 and orange hulled vessel which was identified as the “Coral Antillarum” in a position approximately 4 miles North East of Wicklow Head.
- 6.2 The Chief Mate took over the bridge watch at 04.00 hours and said that there was poor visibility about one and half or one mile. He said that he did not have a look-out rating on watch. That was his decision. The Second Officer had advised him that there had been thick fog earlier for about 40 minutes. At 04.20 hours the “Coral Antillarum” was off Dublin and they were out of the fog with visibility 5 to 6 miles. The traffic was busy in the area. At about 06.40 to 06.50 hours the fog started again and strong patches at 07.05 to 07.15 hours.
- 6.3 The Chief Mate also said that he does not sound a fog signal until he observes a target ship on the radar and he had not reduced speed at any time during his watch. He was aware of the requirement to call the Master but decided not to do so.
- 6.4 The Company Standing Orders, Navigation and Bridge Organisation which is part of the Safety Management System (ISM Code) and that the Master’s Standing Orders were signed as read and understood by the Watchkeeping officers. (See Appendices 8.13, 8.14 and 8.15)

Three abstracted documents that form part of the ISM Code are; Company Standing Orders, Master’s Standing Orders and Navigation and Bridge Organisation are clear in the requirements for: (i) Additional look-out between sunset and sunrise, in fog or other conditions of restricted visibility occur or are suspected (ii) speed adjusted to a safe speed (iii) qualified helmsman must be available on the bridge and (iv) Underway Watch Conditions (watch type C).

- 6.5 The Chief Engineer said that he had just finished breakfast at 07.30 hours and went to the bridge. He said he did not hear anything or feel anything unusual.
- 6.6 The “Coral Antillarum” passage plan took the vessel from South Rock off the Down coast to 2 miles to east of Howth Head and then on the inshore route, inside the Kish Bank, Codling Bank, India Bank, Arklow Bank, outside Blackwater Bank, and inside Tusker Rock Inshore Traffic Zone.

The inner route from South Rock as laid out on the Passage Plan is 2.5 miles shorter than proceeding down the Irish Sea and keeping outside (East) of the Codling Light and keeping to the Traffic Separation Scheme off Tusker Rock. The inner route affords comparatively smooth waters though it may have a lot

of inshore fishing vessels working in the region. The current edition of the Irish Pilot Book NP 40 does not recommend that a tanker or similar type vessels should not use the inner route.

- 6.7 Positions were marked on the chart at 07.15, 07.25 and 07.30 hours where the course would appear to have been adjusted to bring the “*Coral Antillarum*” back on the track. This would necessitate the Chief Mate giving attention to taking the radar bearings and distances and place them on the chart in the chart room. The time of reporting the collision was logged by the Irish Coast Guard at 07.24 hours.

The “*Coral Antillarum*” was travelling at full speed in bad visibility, in an area known to be heavily used by small fishing boats. It is apparent that the “*Coral Antillarum*” was not maintaining a proper lookout (physical or radar) and was not making sound signals.

- 6.8 It is apparent that the “*Coral Antillarum*” as a power driven vessel was responsible under the International Regulations for Prevention of Collision at Sea, 1972 as amended: - Rule 2 (Responsibility), Rule 5 (Look-out), Rule 6 (Safe Speed), Rule 19 (b) & (c) (Conduct of vessels in restricted visibility), Rule 35 (a) (Sound signals in restricted visibility). (See Appendix 8.16).
- 6.9 The “*Clara*” under rule 35 (i) and as a vessel of less than 12 meters is not required to give the sound signals mentioned in Rule 35 but, if she does not, shall make some other efficient sound signal at intervals of not more than 2 minutes. Annex III of the Rules gives technical details of sound signal appliances.
- 6.10 The “*Clara*” was fishing in restricted visibility and was not maintaining a proper lookout.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 7.1 A copy of this report should be presented to the Netherlands Maritime Administration.
- 7.2 The Department of Communications, Marine and Natural Resources should publish a Marine Notice bringing to the mariners' attention the standards regarding watchkeeping contained in Chapter VIII of the STCW Code including the International Chamber of Shipping Bridge Procedures Guide. In conjunction the operator/ owners auditing responsibilities under the ISM Code should ensure compliance with the keeping of watchkeeping standards.
- 7.3 The Department of Communications, Marine and Natural Resources should re-iterate Marine Notice No. 9 of 2002 and bring it to the attention of Fishermen, the requirement under Rule 35 of the Collision Regulations to make the appropriate sound signals in restricted visibility.

8. APPENDICES

- 8.1 Chartlet of area Dublin to Waterford.
- 8.2 Larger scale Chartlet of area Dublin to Arklow
- 8.3 This is a photograph of the “Clara” alongside Wicklow 24th August 2000. The side ramp for landing and re-baiting pots is seen on the starboard side.
- 8.4 Photograph showing the “Coral Antillarum” alongside IFI, Marino Point, Cork
25th August 2000.
- 8.5 Weather Report from Met Eireann for 24th August 2000.
- 8.6 Passage Plan – inner route.
- 8.7 Copy from the working chart of the “Coral Antillarum”.
- 8.8 Pages 23B and 24B taken from Deck Log of the “Coral Antillarum”.
- 8.9 Photograph showing the starboard aft corner of the “Clara” which was impacted by the “Coral Antillarum”.
- 8.10 This photograph shows a closer view of the side ramp where the paint chippings from the “Coral Antillarum” landed and were retained by the Investigator.
- 8.11 Photograph showing a closer view of the “Coral Antillarum” where the indentations may be seen below and aft of the anchor and just below the top line of the boot topping.
- 8.12 This photograph shows a close up of the collision area and samples being taken. Retained by the Investigator and are on file.
- 8.13 Company Standing Order (1 page, page 5 of 12).
- 8.14 Master’s Standing Orders (1 page).
- 8.15 Navigation and Bridge Organisation. (5 pages).
- 8.16 Copy of applicable Collision Rules.

9 INDEX OF CORRESPONDENCE

Correspondent	<u>Page No.</u>
Irish Coast Guard	39
<i>MCIB Response</i>	39
Anthony Veder Rederijzaken B.V.	40
(Ship Managers and Marine Consultants)	
<i>MCIB Response</i>	42

**MCIB Response to Anthony Veder Rederijzaken B.V.'s letter
dated 17th November 2003**

The “*Clara*” is a registered fishing vessel and at the time of the incident was engaged in fishing as defined in Regulations 3 (d) of the International Regulations for Preventing Collisions at Sea. “*Clara*” was not displaying the correct lights or shapes while engaged in fishing as contained within Rule 26. This has already been acknowledged in paragraph 4.4 of the Report. Under different circumstances it may well have had a bearing on the incident but not in this situation as the non-compliance had no direct affect on the incident as the single watch keeper on board the chemical tanker “*Coral Antillarum*” did not appear to observe “*Clara*” either visually or by radar as stated in paragraph 6.8 of the Report.

The point made by the owners of “*Coral Antillarum*” is already noted in paragraph 6.10 of the Report – “ The “*Clara*” was fishing in restricted visibility and was not maintaing a proper lookout”.

APPENDIX 8.9



APPENDIX 8.10



APPENDIX 8.11



APPENDIX 8.12



APPENDIX 8.3



APPENDIX 8.4



